

Guidelines for creating the minutes in appointment procedures

Minutes document the work of the appointment committee in appointment procedures. The documents serve for the purpose of accountability and quality assurance as well as the legal security of the procedures.

I. Minimum requirements of the UoC

When drawing up the minutes, the appointment committees can follow the requirements of Section 3 of the UoC Rules of Procedure. Typically, a result log should be created that should include at least the following information:

- the place and day of the meeting,
- the names of the members present and of all other persons,
- the approved agenda,
- the terms of the amendments to the last protocol,
- the terms of the last requests and the results of the vote,
- the quorum of the committee and the decisions taken,
- the results of elections,
- statements requested to be included in the minutes.

II. External case law

It is also important for the legal certainty of the appointment procedure that **decisions of the committees are comprehensibly documented**, in particular **its relevant selection considerations**. The case law on the obligation to document in appointment procedures stipulates: *...There is “no need for meeting minutes, in particular no verbatim records of the talks, but the questions addressed to the candidates or the topics discussed, the answers of the candidates, the evaluation of these answers by the appointment committee as well as the personal impression of the candidates must at least be recorded in keywords.”* (Verwaltungsgericht Frankfurt of 25 August 2014, file no. 3 K 840/11)

“It is not necessary to have a verbatim record, but rather a summary of the questions and answers as well as the teaching sample in bullet points would have sufficed.” (Oberverwaltungsgericht NRW of 27 April 2017, file no. 6 A 277/16)

III. Recommendations

- The summary in bullet points of the questions and answers as well as the teaching sample and the evaluation of the answers by the appointment committee should be recorded. Collective evaluations without specific reference to the performance of individual candidates must be avoided.
- In particular, the list of criteria for evaluating applications based on the tender text and its application, as well as (potentially) existing biases, must be fully documented, as these are two particularly vulnerable points in the procedure.
- Activities that serve to get to know the candidates (joint lunch/dinner, visits to sites, etc.) should at least be addressed in the minutes in order to ensure traceability here as well.
- If not created centrally by the Dean's office, the Faculty should provide a minutes template for the meetings of appointment committees.
- In order to ensure that the minutes are accessible to all members of the committees, it is recommended to upload the minutes via the document filing function in the appointment portal. This should be notified by e-mail, or the document can also be sent by e-mail.

If you have any questions, please contact the Staff Unit 03 Recruitment Management.